

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: May 22, 2018

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:00 p.m.

Members present: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent: Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Note: The following items were heard in the order of the applicant's arrival.

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the April 24, 2018 meeting
Motion: Approve the minutes.
By: Elliott Perkins
Second: Beth Jacob
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
2. 2627 Tchoupitoulas St..
Application: John Lambertson, applicant; Tchoup Party Stop LLC, owner; Demolition of (3) existing one story warehouse buildings and new construction of five-story, self-storage facility.
Speakers: Thomas P Mcalister spoke in favor of the application. Todd Kennedy, Bill Sawicki, Al Bostick, spoke against the application.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details of the metal cladding to be worked out at the ARC level. The upper floors clad in metal should be setback the width of a parapet at the Tchoupitoulas St and Fourth St sides.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
3. 1600 Magazine.
Comments: This item was withdrawn.
4. 1814 McShane Pl.
Comments: This item was withdrawn.

5. 6025 Bienvenue St.

Comments: This item was withdrawn.

6. 4125 St Charles Ave.

Comments: This item was withdrawn.

7. 4841 Canal St.

Application: Gregory Hackenberg, applicant; St John Cemetery Assn Inc, St John Cemetery Assn Inc, owner; Exterior restroom and storage area two-story addition in an interior courtyard.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Option 2 as submitted should be utilized. Height of addition to match height of existing building.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 3911 Dauphine St.

Application: Nat Jones, applicant; Maria M Valbuena, owner; Retention of deviation of approved camelback addition on a single-family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to approve the window placement on the camelback addition as built. No further action is required.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 3700 N Rampart.

Application: Joseph Lavigne, applicant; 3700 N Rampart LLC, owner; New construction of a 2-story, 1910 sq ft single family residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer action on this application. The ARC agreed that the building as proposed does not fit within the existing context. Consider:

- The rigidity of form does not match adjacent buildings.
- Lighten the columns to reduce the monumentality of the proposal.
- The form and materiality are more reflective of a commercial building than the adjacent context.
- Investigate an eave design as opposed to a parapet design at the roof.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 3013 Chartres St.

Application: Axel A/D/P, applicant; Hazel R Laborde, Hazel R Laborde, owner; New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Submit cut sheets for windows and doors detailing prior to purchase and installation for Staff approval to ensure the built condition will reflect the ARC Approved submittal. Doors and windows need to coordinate on the façade of the building.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 608 Sixth St.

Application: Charles Berg, applicant; 608 6Th Street LLC, owner; Construct new covered porch condition to rework interior stair.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend denial of the application. The stair should be reworked internally.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 725 Seveth St.

Application: Marty Mcelveen, applicant; Monarch Investment Holdings LLC, owner; Construct 704 SF addition to an existing one-story residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 2124 Laurel St.

Application: Sabri Farouki, applicant; 4318 Bienville LLC, owner; New construction of a single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The height of the balcony railing should not exceed 36".

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments

13. 5460 Royal St.

Application: Marc Berard Jr, applicant; Cole Wollerman, owner; New construction of a 2,360 SF residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer action on this application. The ARC agreed that the proposal must be revised to reflect the following:

- Remove transoms above the windows.
- Lower the roof pitch from 9:12 to 7:12.
- Rear portion of building width needs to be reduced such that it is only 1-bay wider than the front portion of the house. 1-bay width is in reference to the design of the front portion of the house.
- Increase depth of front porch to 6'-0".
- Gable vent shape to be rectangular or triangular.
- Revise windows throughout to be of uniform header height and of similar size, shape and proportion. Reduce the number of different window types throughout the proposal.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 5442 Burgundy St.
Application: Erik Holmberg, applicant; Alansons Development LLC, owner; Camelback addition to an existing one-story single family residential building.
Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.
Second: Elliott Perkins
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
15. 1017 Fourth St.
Application: Chris Tayeh, applicant; Maurice Tayeh, owner; Construct double gallery on existing two-story, residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The double gallery portion should be limited to the original two bay structure, a smaller bracket supported balcony would be more appropriate for the left side. The opening at the left can then be protected by an awning if desired. Although the expansion of the porch will not require a variance, it will need to be fire rated to meet building code.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
16. 1004 Phillip St.
Application: Alexander Adamick, applicant; Cheryl S Hauver, owner; Renovate existing two-story residential building. Construct two-story addition at the right side elevation, replacing an existing enclosed porch and one-story addition.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The deck railing at the side elevation should be replaced with a solid, garden wall.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
17. 1127 Terspichore St.
Application: James Brown, applicant; Coliseum Place Baptist Church, owner; New construction of two-story, single-family residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:

18. 1219 Henriette Delilie St.

Application: Robert Pell, applicant; William N Faulkner, owner; Renovation of a two-story, single-family residential building and construction of dormer.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the proposed gable windows are appropriate. The ARC stated that the new gable dormer should be redesigned as a shed dormer, springing from a point below the ridge.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

19. 3909 Dauphine St.

Application: Ryan Daigle, applicant & owner; Alvin L Sr Diecedue; Construct 840 SF two-story addition to existing single-family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Revise design to remove additional roof and wall piece over side door and replace with a simple awning to match Arts & Crafts detailing of existing building.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

20. 826 N Robertson St.

Application: Ahmad Larkins, applicant; Reginald Youngblood, owner; Rear addition to an existing residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend denial of this application. The ARC agreed that the two-story addition changes the mass and form of the historic structure to such an extent as to make it unrecognizable. The ARC further noted that the low slope of the proposed roof is not contextual. The ARC recommended that any addition to the building be designed in such a manner as to make the historic form evident, with the addition secondary.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

21. 3610 St Claude St.

Application: John Guarnieri, applicant; Ywllow Slide LLC, owner; New construction of a multi-family residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer action on this application.

The ARC voted to defer action on this application. The ARC agreed that the massing of the proposal does not reflect the adjacent context. The applicant should consider:

- Reduce the heaviness and opacity of the side walls of the second floor porch.
- Replace the double cantilever with a simplified single cantilever.
- Use open railings as opposed to solid railings on upper porch.
- The building reads as a building dropped on top of a smaller building. Work to unify the first and second floors so they read as a single building.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

22. 526 Marigny St.

Application: John Guarnieri, applicant; Ywllow Slide LLC, owner; New construction of a multi-family residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the stepped massing flanking the stair element creates a monumentality that increases the perceived mass of the building. It appears to overwhelm the adjacent structures in both size and mass. The ARC agreed the proposal itself is successful, but doesn't align with the proposed site. The ARC recommended investigating strategies to break down the mass at the street edge and reduce the monumentality of the proposal. The ARC recommended shifting the stair tower and third story back at the front and side elevations to address the small scale of the adjacent structures. Additionally, they recommended raising the second level to hide the exposed railings at the exterior open space at the third level. The ARC agreed that the proposed materiality is successful and appropriate for the proposal.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

23. 2223 Carondelet St.

Application: Rodney Ratliff, applicant; 2223 Carondelet LLC, owner; New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC noted that, as drawn, the proposed building appears diminutive and not in keeping with the context. The ARC recommended that the second floor ceiling height should be raised and that the overall scale should be reevaluated. The columns on the front porch should be rectangular with the longer ends facing the street. The ARC stated that the window sill heights on the second floor side elevations need to be raised and windows need to be added on the side elevations close to the front of the house. The ARC also recommended that the front gable should have more detail in keeping with the style of the residence.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

24. 600 Lesseps St.

Application: John W Andrews LLC, applicant; Inc. Fno, Fno Inc, owner; Camelback addition to existing single-family residential building.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommended conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Extend roof of rear addition over rear porch to simplify proposed roof forms.
- The roof of the addition should to be hipped at both ends.
- Windows of the addition must match window detailing on the existing building.
- Remove cornices from windows in addition.
- Rear elevation needs to be changed such that columns align, stairs fit within new column layout, and simple “service-wing box columns” are utilized.

General coordination of drawings and accuracy of drawings needs to be addressed for final submission.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

25. 3321 St Charles Ave.

Application: Diane Hickman, applicant; Donald's Corp (017/0107) Mc, Mc Donald's Corp (017/0107), owner; New construction of 4,300 SF commercial building (McDonald's).

Speakers: Linda M Walker, Robert Clepper, Chris Harrington, and Ralph Long spoke against the application.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed the glazing pattern at the storefront will be legible from the public right of way and requested the mullions be added to the elevations for review. The ARC requested additional views to understand all elements of the proposal, i.e. the 'Fast Forward' structure that appears to be proud of the plane of the front elevation. The ARC requested that additional rendered views be included in the next ARC review packet as well as updated floor plans.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

26. 1431 Clouet St.

Application: Clifton James, applicant; Bywater Bayou Living LLC, owner; New construction of a 1668 SF single-family residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer action on this application. The ARC agreed that the proposal is too horizontal in proportion and does not fit with the historic context. The ARC recommended:

- Regularize the column spacing on the front elevation so that the columns are equally spaced. Adjust stairs appropriately.
- Study to composition of the front elevation. If an asymmetrical design is desired, the overall design should be balanced.
- Remove or significantly reduce overhangs. As designed they reduce the apparent height of the wall, adding to the building's horizontality.
- Additionally, the overhang does not work on the front porch at the intersection of the column/beam/fascia design.
- Foundation vents should be located in relation to the design of the façade above.
- Increase roof pitch to 7:12.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

27. 701 Forstall St.

Application: Clifton James, applicant; Allan B Jones, owner; New construction of 3352 SF two-story multi-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend denial of the application. The ARC agreed that the form of the proposal is fundamentally non-contextual, and as such, inappropriate.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.